

Maryland Commission on Climate Change

November 9, 2016, 12:30-2:30pm

Meeting Notes

Attendees: Ben Grumbles, Nancy Kopp, Karen Salmon, Susan Payne, Hans Schmidt, Ellington Churchill, Mark Belton, Earl Lewis, Jason Dubrow, Mary Beth Turn, Donald Boesch, Chuck Fry, Dr. Jane Kirschling, Charles Deegan, Senator Paul Pinsky, Stuart Clarke, Jim Strong, Michael Powell, Delegate Dana Stein, C. Richard D'Amato, Larry Kasecamp, Anne Lindner, Hampden Macbeth, Jim Doyle, Kate Charbonneau, Dan Engelberg, Arjun Makhijani, Jay Apperson, Chris Beck, Megan Ulrich, Erick Thunell, Jess Herpel, Luke Wisniewski, Chris Hoagland, Lisa Nissley

On the Phone: Lori Arguelles, Councilwoman Deni Taveras, Brian Ambrette

Agenda Item 1: Intro

- Ben gave the intro
 - Nearly every commission member is here today, thank you all

Agenda Item 2: Annual Report Review/Vote

- Brian on review of 2016 report
 - The full MCCC approved work group (WG) recommendations from all 4 work groups
 - MDE then took the recommendations and drafted the annual report
 - Shared with WG's and steering committee
 - About 26 pages, history and makeup, science and policy, public health and equity, etc.
 - Ch. 5 is the WG recommendations, rearranged into paragraph form
 - The Appendix has the exact recommendations and is referenced within the text
 - Also a little language on the process of Work Group's making recommendations
 - Appendices
 - Action plans, legislation, Work Group members and recommendations
 - MDE is already working on finishing the Annual Report, if we can approve it today
- Questions
 - On Energy in page 14: do we know the percentage in MD? Should identify this does not come from state specific values
 - We don't have state specific data, EPA's national numbers were used
 - Appendix B, under ARWG recommendations, page 82, paragraph 3
 - Terminology change – organized labor addition
 - Ben: The report is not complete, however the Commission did already vote on and approve the language of the working group recommendations

- Can we address your concern without inserting one specific group?
 - Organized labor was added to the list “...to include business, organized labor, and industry representatives...”
 - Motion passed unanimously
 - Senator Pinsky- if there are motions of substance, they should be included or discussed (I want to do more than wordsmithing at this meeting - see his later comments)
- Page 26 – part of MWG
 - Looking at the spot where people lose fossil fuel industry jobs
 - “...and if there are negatives, what then?” – MWG isn’t there yet though, its first working on quantifying what the impacts will be
 - We’ll note this in our smaller WG meeting later this month
 - Why are we looking at only negative factors? What about positive (people reading won’t know positives)
 - Don supporting - NG production could be positive
 - Consensus vote to update language “...the existing and prospective GHG reduction programs and policies that may or do have negative or positive impacts on these groups.”
- Change the title in the next section to Scientific and Technical Working Group
- Senator Pinsky – on Mitigation Working Group Recommendations
 - I want to see mass transit in the report, lowering the volume of personal vehicles as well as Vehicle Miles Traveled should be a high priority
 - Add language about reducing miles traveled and use of cars/mass transportation
 - Tad – we attempted to get at this in our recommendations, we can just add it in specifically along with a few other things we want to focus on (Appendix C)
 - It *will* go into the body report as well, since body is just summary of the recommendations
- Senator Pinsky – on Mitigation Working Group Recommendations
 - Waiting until 2019 is too long to make work plan recommendations, early emissions reductions go farther
 - Put language, sometime 2017 MDE share with Commission suggestions to get possible reductions
 - Sooner we have strategies formulated, the better off we are
 - Let’s make a solid date for MWG to give plans
 - Tad: we intended to capture this idea on page 24, would strengthening the language be acceptable?
 - Update on 25 by 20 and 40 by 30
 - Our intention is to continue to provide updates
 - Tad came back to this after some discussion
 - Language added to the second bullet of the 40 by 30 Status Report (and within the associated summary

language in Chapter 5), “these updates will continue through 2017 with specific focus on potential reduction recommendations”

- Senator really wants updates on the progress of reduction strategies
- Stuart – we should work that into the law if we’re going through with this; MDE already has a responsibility to report to the Commission
- MDE has and will continue to provide updates
- Senator Pinsky - we’re relying on on-going reductions from cheap natural gas and falling VMT
 - Wants us to look proactively for reduction possibilities
 - Doesn’t want to put too much on the back end to solve later
 - Answer – we are planning for what you’re saying
 - Each action we recommend has to be accompanied by scientific and economic analysis
 - Example: methane in this report
 - The intent is that there will be more items next year to bring up
- Treasurer Kopp - lack of specificity in the recommendations
 - This is something that the working groups will address in their 2017 Work Plans
 - Consensus on inclusion of a sentence noting this (added to page 22)
- Senator Pinsky – ARWG Recommendations
 - Unclear to him the effect of change in practice in state agencies
 - Building roads at sea level on the shore, will they last for the years, I haven’t seen the data
 - Earl Lewis noted MDOT's recent activities, including SHA's efforts to determine public roads and infrastructure potentially impacted
 - It should be more than just internal in MDOT, which it is now
 - In the report it has language about it, obviously not specific into the engineering however..
- Consensus approval for report after edits are made

Agenda Item 3: Updates on WG activities since last meeting

- ARWG
 - Made forms, how can we use collective expertise to focus on specific issue or challenge
 - Identify gaps
 - Focused how to better delivered tools to local governments and combine grant programs
 - The second meeting on the impacts of climate on state revenues, went in depth with highways, developers, and coastal zone considerations
 - Recommendation made to coast guard council for coastal zones and how to apply to riverine environments
 - The third meeting on vulnerable communities

- Finalized coastal resiliency effort, catalogued vulnerable communities
 - Looked at broadening local partnerships, public and private
 - Best ways to engage and what's affecting small business
 - Mapping tool to quantify how ready communities are for dangerous potential impacts of climate change
 - Lot of opportunities to work with education group
- ECO
 - Nothing additional to report
- MWG
 - Meeting on the 28th, focus on 2017 work plan, including suggestions from Senator Pinsky
 - We're doing things with methane leakage, electric vehicles and developing energy strategies
- STWG
 - Future, we will inform you with TMDL (Total Maximum Daily Load) process
 - Legislation calls specifically for focus on agriculture
 - Impacts and emissions
 - Better ways to track for GHG inventories

Agenda Item 4: UMCES update

- UMCES was given 100k by the Town Creek Foundation to help
- Moving ahead with:
 - Annual report products, education and communication products
 - Healthy soils initiative
- Still working on and discussing:
 - Enhanced tools for climate change
 - Assessment on local government's readiness for climate change

Agenda Item 5: Tentative 2017 schedule

- Similar schedule to this year
- April 19, June 21, September 20, October 18, November 1, all 1-3pm and on Wednesdays
- Have Working Group recommendations ready for discussion at the Sept 20th meeting

Agenda Item 6: Public comment

- Georgetown Climate Center
 - Draft that includes topics such as methane emissions, integrating equity, and the grid of the future
 - Will send to anyone interesting; looking for feedback, thoughts and concerns

Meeting adjourned at 2:03